

Measure G Annual Report – 2016-2017 (Year Two)

From: Measure G Parcel Tax, Citizens' Oversight Committee (the "Committee")

To: Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District Board of Trustees (the "Board")
685 East Jack London Boulevard
Livermore, CA 94551

Dated: **June 5, 2017**

Background

On June 3, 2014, 72.41% of Livermore voters approved Measure G ("Parcel Tax"). This measure authorized the Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District (the "District") to levy an annual tax of \$138 per parcel with exemptions for citizens over the age of 65, if they applied. This Parcel Tax commenced on July 1, 2015 and remains in effect for seven (7) fiscal years. This report covers the second fiscal year of the tax.

The stated purpose of Measure G is to provide financial support to public school programs within the District (including the two charter schools operated by the Tri-Valley Learning Corporation in Livermore, California: Livermore Valley Charter School and Livermore Valley Charter Preparatory High School [the "Charter Schools"]), as follows:

- Provide advanced courses in math, science, and engineering;
- Keep schools well-maintained;
- Attract and retain highly qualified teachers;
- Provide elementary school science and technology specialists;
- Keep classroom technology and instructional materials up-to-date; and
- To the extent funds are available, to maintain academic programs, including the purchase of instructional equipment, materials and supplies.

The measure requires the formation of an independent Measure G Parcel Tax Citizens' Oversight Committee. The Committee is responsible for conducting an annual review to ensure that proceeds of the Parcel Tax are spent wisely and only for the purposes named in Measure G.

Membership

The Committee was appointed by the Board and convened in March 2017 with the following members:

Ted Michels, Chair
Lena Gubiotti, Secretary
Chung Bothwell
Natalie Burbach

Sheryl Goodman
Keven Hempel
Will Macedo
Tyler Olson

Committee History

The Committee's first meeting was held on March 16, 2017. Four of the members are serving the second year of their two-year term while the other four members are in the first year of their two-year term. Meetings were held to provide all members with an opportunity to review and discuss the information and documents upon which this report is based. Meetings were conducted in accordance with the Brown Act and were open to the public. The District provided reports, answered questions, and assisted the Committee as requested. In particular, Susan Kinder (Chief Business Official) and Nancy Ramirez (Executive Assistant, Business Services) assisted the Committee on behalf of the District, and were available to answer questions, provide support, and attend meetings as requested by the Committee. Information was requested from the Charter Schools, but no information was provided to, or received by, the Committee from the Charter Schools.

Measure G Revenue FY2016-2017

During the budgetary process, the District's consultant, Francisco & Associates, estimated that Measure G would generate \$3,888,012 in revenue. Based on the Memorandum of Understanding dated March 18, 2014, by and between the District and the Charter Schools (the "MOU"), for the fiscal year 2016-2017, the District was allocated \$3,615,376 of Measure G proceeds to fund District schools, and the Charter Schools were originally allocated 7.14% of the total or \$272,636 of Measure G proceeds.¹ There was no reserve carry-over noted from the prior fiscal year (2015-2016) under Measure G.

Parcels and Exemptions

Measure G funding for fiscal year 2016-17 was based upon the number of parcels submitted to the Contra Costa County and Alameda County Auditor's offices for placement on the tax roll. Pursuant to the October 5, 2016 report (the "Final Special Tax Information for FY2016-17 Report") prepared by Francisco & Associates, Inc., on behalf of the District, there were 29,928 taxable parcels in the District in Alameda County and 126 taxable parcels in the District in Contra Costa County. The Final Report indicates there were 1,880 exemptions granted. After deducting the 1,880 exempted parcels, the Final Assessment Report placed the number of parcels paying the tax at 28,174. Compared to fiscal year 2015-16, this represents an increase of 447 taxable parcels and a decrease of 15 exemptions. This translates to an increase of \$61,686 over last year's Measure G funding of \$3,826,326.

Assessment Fees

The District pays an assessment fee to Alameda County and Contra Costa County for collecting this supplemental tax. This year the total fee is budgeted at \$71,500, which represents approximately 1.8% of total Measure G funding that was split between the District (\$64,421) and the Charter Schools (\$5,079).

¹ The Committee has been informed by the District that the Charter Schools' allocation of Measure G proceeds will be revised to account for the Charter Schools' declining enrollment.

District Programs Funded by Measure G

Based on the information provided to the Committee by the District, the Committee is satisfied that the Measure G funds received by the District for fiscal year 2016-17 were budgeted and, if expended as budgeted, will be spent in accordance with Measure G. Examples as to how Measure G funds have been, or will be, spent in fiscal year 2016-17 are set forth below and are categorized according to the stated purposes of Measure G.

Provide Advanced Courses in Math, Science, and Engineering

The District used Measure G funds to add 10.08 FTE (full-time equivalent) at a cost of \$1,007,929 for this reporting period, or approximately 28% of the available funds in 2016-2017. Each middle school received funding to add 0.75 FTE of staff time dedicated to support courses in the areas of math, science and engineering, totaling 3.75 FTE for all middle schools at a cost of \$353,130. The staff also provides support for high schools focusing on STEM subjects. For the three Livermore high schools, an amount of \$654,799 was allocated to this area. This represents 6.33 FTEs supporting the advanced courses for Del Valle, Granada and Livermore High Schools.

For this reporting period, Del Valle offered students courses in C-STEM, algebra, and a robotics course. At Granada High courses were offered in Introduction to Engineering Design, Civil Architecture and Engineering, Principals of Engineering (POE), Introduction to Computer Science (IED), AP Computer Science, Biotechnology, and Game Design. At Livermore High courses were offered in Green Engineering Academy, Principals of Engineering (POE), Introduction to Computer Science (IED), AP Computer Science, Electronics, Engineering Research and Design, and Engineering Physics.

Keep Schools Well-Maintained

Measure G provided \$200,000, or approximately 5.5% of the available funds in 2016-2017, to augment maintenance efforts throughout the District. A portion of this year's funds was dedicated to improving safety at all sites, such as purchasing new standardized uniforms for maintenance personnel, performing annual servicing of all District fire extinguishers, and the certification of the Livermore High elevator. Another portion of this year's funds was spent on replacing service tools and material handling equipment. This new equipment will promote better response times to the maintenance needs at all sites.

Attract and Retain Highly Qualified Teachers

The District did not specifically allocate any Parcel Tax funds for this budget category. Instead, the District believes that by focusing its efforts on the other Measure G categories where it is providing advanced courses, computer equipment, classroom teaching materials, and science and technology specialists, the District will help the teachers be more productive in the classroom and enhance the learning experience for the students in and out of the classroom. The overall classroom environment is further enhanced by smaller class sizes that allow teachers more time to focus on each student, which the District feels has helped it to retain teachers. The District believes the foregoing has helped to attract and retain highly qualified teachers.

Provide Elementary School Science and Technology Specialists

For 2016-2017, Measure G provided \$1,595,796 to the District for elementary science specialists and \$435,426 for elementary technology specialists, or approximately 56% of the available funds in 2016-2017. This translates into 15.3 FTE for elementary science specialists and 4.0 FTE for elementary technology specialists for the nine elementary schools and two K-8 schools in the District.

At their assigned school sites, the elementary technology specialists collaborate with school staff for instructional planning, observation, feedback, co-teaching, and modeling strategies while showcasing how to effectively integrate technology into teaching and learning. Professional development activities have focused on supporting teacher/student proficiencies, providing the technology skills teachers must possess to meet the needs of the students they teach. When the elementary technology specialists are not directly working with teachers, they are conducting research to maintain up-to-date knowledge of effective instructional and coaching models and stay connected to District resources/departments. It is important to note that elementary technology specialists work with teachers based on teacher request. Hence, the level of activities and support provided are driven by teachers rather than the elementary technology specialists themselves.

The elementary science specialists conduct science labs once or twice each week to explore science through hands-on activities. The elementary science specialists have also helped with engineering projects and *Makers Space* activities. Staff reports that having a hands-on elementary science specialist is invaluable to the students, offering weekly opportunities for interactive hands-on learning to enhance classroom instruction. The time students spend in the lab also allows elementary teachers to have a prep period, enabling them to monitor assessments and plan curriculum.

To ensure equity and consistency, the teams of specialists meet weekly to share experiences, best practices, and innovative tools to articulate and continue modeling educational shifts in the classroom, as well as to diagnose areas of concern.

In partnership with the teachers, both the elementary science and technology specialists have developed and implemented a multitude of programs District-wide for the 2016-2017 school year, including:

- Supporting teachers by modeling and supporting them in running *Breakout Edu Activities*, an immersive gaming platform that reinforces grade level content and encourages problem solving, collaboration, and critical thinking. For more information see: <http://www.breakoutedu.com/>
- Supporting teachers and students in learning about *Google Suite* (docs, sheets, slides, forms) for various uses such as projects, reports, data collection, presentations, online testing, and classroom management with one-on-one teacher training and lesson demonstrations
- Introducing *Hyperdocs*, a digital lesson plan that allows students to explore multiple resources and become knowledge constructors
- Demonstrating lessons to teachers on computer programming/coding using such tools as *code.org* and *Scratch* and participating in the *Hour of Code*
- Training teachers and students on use of online digital portfolios of their work with reflections using tools including *Seesaw* and *Google Sites*; *Seesaw* is a tool that easily allows students to upload video/audio of themselves reading or reflecting on learning, images of their work, and allows them to share that work with their families
- Offering teachers creative and meaningful ways to transition traditional pen and paper projects into multimedia digital presentations

In addition to the accomplishments across the District, site-specific activities and initiatives include:

Altamont Creek

- Teaching teachers/students how to use *Tinkercad* for 3D modeling for printing allowing students to create 3D models of items/homes from literature, as well as activating the 3D printer

- Reinforcing digital citizenship skills with discussion and use of *Hyperdocs*
- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebook by using programs such as *MobyMax*, *typing.com*, *Prodigy Math*, *Khan Academy*, *code.org*, *Xtra Math*, etc.

Arroyo Seco

- Modeling an increasingly complex series of coding lessons for a teacher who, in turn, taught the same series of lessons to all the students in her grade during grade level rotation time
- Introducing and modeling *Digital Breakouts* in Kindergarten, a concept that is modeled after breakouts, but allows for even more collaboration

Croce

- Supporting teachers in finding/running *Breakout Edu activities* (as noted above); this activity was so popular that the site purchased two kits of their own, and teachers are now running their own activities
- Helping reinforce digital citizenship skills with classroom presentations
- Helping teachers and students to create digital video presentations using *Animoto*, *mySimpleShow*, and other online tools, covering projects such as book reports, state reports, etc.
- Introducing and modeling *Digital Breakouts* in Kindergarten, a concept that is modeled after breakouts, but allows for even more collaboration

Emma C. Smith

- Modeling lessons on digital storytelling using tools such as *MySimpleShow*, *Storyboard That*, *Animoto*, etc.
- Introducing teachers to green screen technology for student presentations of their learning (e.g., presenting state reports in front of slides they created, presenting animal reports in front of videos of the animals they studied about)
- Supporting implementation of entry level robotics using *Dash* and *Dot* robots
- Supporting teachers in finding/running *Breakout Edu activities* (as noted above); the program was so successful, the site now has three kits
- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebooks by using programs noted above
- Reinforcing digital citizenship skills with discussion and use of *Hyperdocs*

Jackson Avenue

- Supporting after school "tech camp" for students interested in coding and robotics
- Assisting in introducing robotics in Transitional Kindergarten and Kindergarten
- Helping support use of *MobyMax* as individualized learning in classrooms K-5
- Assisting in setup for *Skype* field trips, including a scientist in Antarctica, a turtle hospital and a bee expert
- Introducing teachers to green screen technology for student presentations of their learning as noted above
- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebook by using programs noted above

Joe Michell

- Implementing a new structure for Middle School Advisory, using an approach that includes *Google Forms* and *Google Classroom*
- Introducing teachers to green screen technology for student presentations of their learning as noted above
- Leading next generation science standards through *Project Lead the Way: Launch* where students are designing solutions to real-world issues using science, technology, engineering and math
- Teaching students to follow engineering processes necessary to design, build, test and evaluate robotic devices, helping them to understand the design cycle and learning through their own experiences as they work through design changes
- Supporting teachers in finding/running *Breakout Edu* Activities (as noted above); it was so successful that the site purchased a kit and uses it weekly during Middle School Advisory
- Reinforcing digital citizenship skills with classroom discussion and through use of *Hyperdocs*

Junction Avenue

- Introducing teachers to green screen technology for student presentations of their learning as noted above
- Introducing the Physical Education Dept. to *Hyperdocs*, which was used to map out lesson plans for the year
- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebook by using programs noted above

Marylin Avenue

- Assisting with the one-to-one Chromebook rollout by training teachers on the flipped classroom model, and demonstrating ways to shift classroom practices when all students have continuous access to a device
- Introducing teachers to green screen technology for student presentations of their learning as noted above
- Introducing and modeling *Digital Breakouts* in Kindergarten, a concept that is modeled after breakouts, but allows for even more collaboration
- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebook by using programs noted above
- Bringing in outside presenters to discuss engineering, astronomy, agriculture, biology, and real-world applications
- Hosting a Science Night for parents and family to showcase projects
- Using the school garden to demonstrate the life cycle of a plant

Rancho Las Positas

- Supporting teachers in finding/running *Breakout Edu activities* (as noted above); this was so well-received that the site purchased two kits of their own, and teachers are now running their own activities
- Introducing teachers to green screen technology for student presentations of their learning as noted above

Satellite

- Introducing and modeling *Digital Breakouts*, a concept that is modeled after breakouts, but allows for even more collaboration

- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebook by using programs noted above
- Supporting primary grade levels in implementing *Osmo*

Sunset

- Modeling the use of technologies such as *Socrative*, *Google Docs*, and *Amazon* to enable teachers to run a "book tournament" in which teams of students write persuasive speeches about their favorite novels and the classes votes on which books advance to the next round
- Encouraging primary grade-level teachers to begin basic keyboarding skills early so that students could start gaining proficiency at a young age
- Teaching primary grade levels how to log into and navigate the Chromebook by using programs noted above

Vineyard

- Focusing on blended learning by helping teachers with Google classroom tools and creation and implementation of *Hyperdocs*

Keep Classroom Technology and Instructional Materials Up-To-Date

From the Measure G tax proceeds received by the District, \$18 per student for a total of \$252,162, or approximately 7.0% of the available funds in 2016-2017, was allocated to keep classroom technology and instructional materials up-to-date. The school sites provided the Committee with numerous examples of how the funds were used to keep classroom technology and instructional materials up-to-date. These include:

- Altamont Creek Elementary expanded its Chromebook program, replaced classroom projectors, and purchased various accessories to keep its technology working effectively.
- Arroyo Seco Elementary used its funding to provide web-based programs to students, such as Educational Software for Guiding Instruction, Accelerated Reader, Adventures to Fitness, Type to Learn, Enchanted Learning, Spelling City, and Mystery Science. Arroyo Seco also used funds to maintain existing equipment and purchase new equipment, such as document cameras, Chromebooks, tablets and stereo systems, as well as technology to aid grade level STEAM units.
- Christensen Middle School used funds to replace classroom technology. It also used funds for Accelerated Reader, which is an online reading program that can be used by each student in the school and supports reading across the school's curriculum.
- Croce Elementary replaced classroom technology, such as projectors and document cameras, and purchased supplies such as printer ink cartridges. Croce also anticipates using funds to expand its Chromebook program.
- Del Valle High School purchased virtual reality glasses and large screen televisions with mounting hardware.
- East Avenue Middle School applied funds towards the purchase of Mac Minis to replace outdated computers, which could no longer support the graphic programs being used in its Multi-Media Arts classes. The new Mac Minis are in East Avenue's Mac Lab where they support various classes in a variety of projects, including research and special projects.
- Emma Smith Elementary used funds to purchase additional time with the school's technology specialist.

- Granada High School applied its funds to purchase technology equipment to aid teachers in their instruction and students in their learning. For example, Granada purchased document cameras, teacher computers, a Chromebook cart, and license upgrades for Microsoft, Turnitin.com, and Kuta software access for all math teachers.
- Jackson Avenue Elementary continued to use its funds to expand the use of Chromebooks in the classroom, as well as maintaining current classroom technology, including projectors and document cameras. The funds were used to purchase computer peripherals and support technologies such as Piper and iPad minis.
- Joe Michell K-8 School used funds to purchase document cameras and Chromebooks to accommodate two middle school classrooms. Joe Michell also provided students with web-based instructional programs, which students can access from home to provide additional instruction at home.
- Junction Avenue K-8 School applied funds toward the purchase of teacher computers and Chromebook replacements.
- Livermore High School used its funds to purchase a two Chromebook carts, computers, and classroom projectors.
- Marilyn Avenue Elementary purchased licenses for reading and math programs, instructional materials to support the school's English Learner students, and hardware to enhance students learning experience.
- Mendenhall Middle School used funds to repair Chromebooks, purchase computers and document cameras for staff, and upgrade sixth grade core teachers' computers.
- The Satellite Campus applied its funds to purchase Makerspace items for its library, which include eight (8) iPads, a green screen, and robots.
- Sunset Elementary updated its classroom projectors and printers. It also purchased replacement Chromebooks, a staff laptop to support reading intervention, and supplies such as toner cartridges.

To the Extent Funds Are Available, to Maintain Academic Programs, Including the Purchase of Instructional Equipment, Materials and Supplies

The District will spend \$52,563, or approximately 1.0% of the available funds in 2016-2017. Most of the funds for K-8 and middle schools totaling \$22,563 were spent on Project Lead The Way ("PLTW") materials. Sites have purchased PLTW materials including Vex Robotic parts, rocket launchers, building kits, and PLTW engineering notebooks. Livermore and Granada High Schools have purchased science lab materials that cost \$30,000.

Charter Schools Programs Funded by Measure G

The Charter Schools were originally allocated approximately 7.14% of the Measure G revenues (\$272,636 est.) in 2016-2017. Since the initial estimate, the Charter Schools allocation has been recalculated based upon current enrollment and future payments will be adjusted accordingly. Requests to the Charter Schools for information verifying those funds were spent according to the language of Measure G have received no response.

Pursuant to the MOU, in exchange for receiving a share of the Measure G tax proceeds, the Charter Schools are obligated to provide, among other things, documentation of their expenditures of Measure G tax proceeds to this Committee. The documentation is required to be provided to this Committee every four months and must, at a minimum, show the amounts of Measure G tax proceeds expended by the Charter Schools for the then applicable reporting period and how those proceeds were expended. The Charter Schools must also comply with any and all requirements set forth by this Committee with regard to the use and dissemination of Measure G tax proceeds.

The Charter Schools have failed to provide any documentation to this Committee for the current 2016-2017 school year. The Charter Schools have also failed to respond to this Committee's inquiries and requests for information. Given the Charter Schools' failure to provide the requisite documentation and respond to this Committee's inquiries, the Committee was unable to report how or if the funds were used to satisfy the stated purpose of Measure G.

Conclusion

The Committee concludes as follows:

The District

The Committee performed a review of the data submitted by the District staff. This review included gathering data to support the District staff's analysis of expenditures related to Measure G, asking questions of the District staff and staff at individual schools under the District's purview, and other fact-finding procedures. The Committee did not perform an independent audit in accordance with auditing standards generally accepted in the United States. Although not specifically required in Measure G, this Committee prepared this report addressed to the Board, thus satisfying our requirement to present this Committee's findings and conclusions "in public."

Based upon the information provided to the Committee by the District, the Committee is satisfied that the funds received for fiscal year 2016-2017 from proceeds of the Parcel Tax, as approved by voters June 2, 2014, valued at \$3,615,376, were in fact budgeted in accordance with the ballot language of Measure G and, if ultimately expended as budgeted by the District, those funds will have been spent by the District in accordance with Measure G.

The Charter Schools

After multiple requests to the Charter Schools for information related to their expenditure of funds from Measure G, the Committee was unable to confirm that the Charter Schools expended the Measure G tax proceeds received by them for the 2016-2017 school year in accordance with the ballot language of Measure G. As a result, this Committee makes the following recommendations to the District:

- No further Measure G tax proceeds be disbursed to the Charter Schools until they have fully complied with their obligations under Measure G and the MOU, including, without limitation, their obligations to provide the requisite documentation and respond to this Committee's inquiries; and
- Due to the Charter Schools' non-responsiveness, the Committee recommends that the District request the return of all funds previously provided to the Charter Schools during the 2016-2017 school year pursuant to section 5.e in the MOU.

[Signatures on following page.]

Respectfully submitted,

Ted Michels, Chair (Year-2)

Lena Gubiotti, Secretary (Year-1)

Chung Bothwell (Year-2)

Natalie Burbach, (Year-1)

Sheryl Goodman (Year-1)

Keven Hempel (Year-1)

Will Macedo (Year-2)

Tyler Olson (Year-2)

NOTE: Signatures are on file.